

City of Hudson, Ohio

Meeting Minutes - Draft Architectural & Historic Board of Review

John Caputo, Chair Allyn Marzulla, Vice Chair John Workley, Secretary John Funyak Françoise Massardier-Kenney William Ray Karl Wetzel

Nicholas Sugar, City Planner Amanda Krickovich, Associate Planner

Wednesday, March 13, 2024

7:30 PM

Town Hall 27 East Main Street

I. Call To Order

Chair Caputo called to order the regularly scheduled meeting of the Architectural & Historic Board of Review of the City of Hudson at 7:30 p.m., in accordance with the Sunshine Laws of the State of Ohio, O.R.C. Section 121.22.

II. Roll Call

Present: 7 - Mr. Caputo, Mr. Funyak, Ms. Kenney, Ms. Marzulla, Mr. Ray, Mr. Wetzel and Mr. Workley

III. Public Comment

Chair Caputo opened the meeting to public comments for anyone wanting to address the Board. There were no comments.

IV. Consent Applications

A motion was made by Mr. Workley, seconded by Mr. Ray, to approve the Consent Agenda. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye: 7 - Mr. Caputo, Mr. Funyak, Ms. Kenney, Ms. Marzulla, Mr. Ray, Mr. Wetzel and Mr. Workley

A. AHBR 24-156 Cutler Lane Entrance (Villas of Hudson)

Ground Signs for Residential Subdivision

<u>Attachments:</u> <u>Cutler Ln. AHBR Packet</u>

This AHBR application was approved on the Consent Agenda.

V. Old Business

A. <u>AHBR 23-1132</u>50 Division Street (Historic District)

Alterations (Door)

Attachments:

50 Division Street Staff Report 3.13.24 Meeting

50 Division St. AHBR Packet

50 Division ST. AHBR Packet 2.28.24 Meeting

50 Division St. AHBR Packet - 2.14.2024 Meeting

Mr. Sugar introduced the application by reviewing its history before AHBR, describing alternate plans including discussion of AHBR granting an exemption which may be done when exceptional conditions exist including safety concerns which staff believes apply in this application. Mr. Sugar also noted the door is a secondary entrance on a 1950s addition to the building and reviewed the staff recommendation.

AHBR members recognized the unique conditions and that the door is appropriate on the addition.

A motion was made by Ms. Kenney, seconded by Ms. Marzulla, that this AHBR Application be approved. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye: 7 - Mr. Caputo, Mr. Funyak, Ms. Kenney, Ms. Marzulla, Mr. Ray, Mr. Wetzel and Mr. Workley

B.

Mr. Sugar introduced the application by reviewing the history of the application, and noting changes to the elevation from the previous plans. Ms. Krickovich noted the chimney materials differ from the existing stone.

Mr. Kevin McCausland, McCausland Landscapes, and Mr. Frank Susnick, BRR Contracting, were present for the meeting.

A motion was made by Ms. Kenney, seconded by Mr. Workley, that this AHBR Application be approved as amended. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye: 7 - Mr. Caputo, Mr. Funyak, Ms. Kenney, Ms. Marzulla, Mr. Ray, Mr. Wetzel and Mr. Workley

VI. New Business

A. <u>AHBR 24-200</u> 112 First Street (D.O Summers Cleaners)

Sign (Wall & Projecting)

Attachments: D.O Summers AHBR Packet

Mr. Sugar introduced the application by displaying the proposed sign and reviewing the staff comments.

Mr. Mike Bizjak, applicant, noted the sign will have a matte finish, will not be illuminated, and will be built on rails which will allow it be moved at a future date.

The Board, applicant and staff discussed: This sign is not compatible with other signs at First and Main and that blade signs are permitted. The applicant distributed a 3-feet by 10-feet, six-inches alternate sign plan to the Board which is not fully approved by the business owner.

A motion was made by Mr. Workley, seconded by Mr. Ray, that the proposed blade sign be approved and that staff may approve the redesigned panel sign . The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye: 7 - Mr. Caputo, Mr. Funyak, Ms. Kenney, Ms. Marzulla, Mr. Ray, Mr. Wetzel and Mr. Workley

B. AHBR 23-109169 West Streetsboro Street (Citizens Bank)

Signs (Building, Awning & Instructional)

Attachments: Citizens Bank AHBR Packet

Mr. Sugar introduced the application by displaying and explaining the sign and site plan, and reviewing the staff recommendations and comments.

Ms. Iliana Kazandziev, Agile Signs, noted a revised drawing will be done and height of the sign will be reduced at the direction of the AHBR.

The Board, applicant and staff discussed the size of the sign and letters, the materials to be used and the materials finish. Mr. Sugar noted a separate application was submitted regarding changes to the building.

Ms. Kenney made a motion, seconded by Mr. Workley to approve with the following conditions: The light bars be removed, and the directional sign letters be two-inches high. The motion was approved by the following vote:

Aye: 6 - Mr. Caputo, Mr. Funyak, Ms. Kenney, Mr. Ray, Mr. Wetzel and Mr. Workley

Nay: 1 - Ms. Marzulla

C. AHBR 24-155 33 E. Main Street (Historic District)

Alterations

Attachments: 33 E. Main St. AHBR Packet

Mr. Sugar introduced the application by displaying historical photos of the house, noting the specific areas of work, and that staff recommends approval.

Ms. Robyn Meeker, owner, noted all the replacement elements will be custom made.

A motion was made by Mr. Workley, seconded by Ms. Marzulla, that this AHBR Application be approved. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye: 7 - Mr. Caputo, Mr. Funyak, Ms. Kenney, Ms. Marzulla, Mr. Ray, Mr. Wetzel and Mr. Workley

D. <u>AHBR 20-875</u> 36 S. Main Street (Yours Truly)

Alteration (Rooftop Screening)

Attachments: Previously Approved Plans

Yours Truly Hudson Photos for AHBR 3.13.24

Mr. Sugar introduced the application by displaying photos of the work done and describing the previous approvals while noting that rooftop equipment was to be screened from the street and public view. Staff's commented that the rooftop mechanicals are visible from the street and made recommendations which may correct the situation.

Mr. Doug Lublick, Yours Truley, stated the screening would need to be thirty-five feet long and and four-feet high and is concerned about wind gusts causing a dangerous condition. Mr. Lublick also stated the current view of the rooftop equipment is better than what was there previously.

The Board, applicant and staff discussed alternatives for the required screening, the problem of the weight of the screening on the rooftop, and that this type of screening is a required for all Hudson buildings.

A motion was made by Ms. Marzulla, seconded by Ms. Kenney, that this AHBR Application be denied. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye: 7 - Mr. Caputo, Mr. Funyak, Ms. Kenney, Ms. Marzulla, Mr. Ray, Mr. Wetzel and Mr. Workley

E. <u>AHBR 24-182</u> 136 Franklin Street (Historic District)

Alteration (Porch Steps)

Attachments: 136 Franklin Street AHBR Packet

Ms. Krickovich introduced the application by displaying and explaining the proposed project on this non-historic, 2014 built house in the Historic District.

Mr. Derek Mills, contractor, noted the columns will be matched and the project footprint will not be changed.

A motion was made by Ms. Kenney, seconded by Mr. Workley, that this AHBR Application be approved. The motion carried by the following vote:

F. AHBR - 23-521290 N. Main (Historic District)

Alterations (Door & Window)

Attachments: 290 N. Main AHBR Packet

Ms. Krickovich introduced the application by displaying the elevations, noting the AHBR approval on June 14, 2023, and reviewing the staff comments.

Mr. Neil Luketic, architect, was present to answer questions.

The Board, applicant and staff discussed the steps being below grade and the doors matching the previously approved doors.

A motion was made by Mr. Funyak, seconded by Mr. Ray, that this AHBR Application be approved. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye: 7 - Mr. Caputo, Mr. Funyak, Ms. Kenney, Ms. Marzulla, Mr. Ray, Mr. Wetzel and Mr. Workley

G. AHBR 24-186 2205 Victoria Parkway

Addition (Second Story, Porch & Garage)

Attachments: 2205 Victoria Parkway AHBR Packet

Ms. Krickovich introduced the application by noting AHBR approved the project on July 14, 2021. Subsequent to the approval staff found the project was not built as approved and conflicts with the Architectural Design Standards.

Mr. Russell Niswander, homeowner, stated the missing first floor windows are due to the garage not previously having windows and the complications they will cause if required. The Board noted vegetation is not permitted in place of fenestration and discussed alternatives to traditional windows. Discussion took place regarding: The grids in the new windows match the existing windows, that the second floor windows are in proportion to each other, that the black portion of the garage door is actually magnets - not windows, and the trim band should not be a requirement since it is not on the rest of the house.

A motion was made by Mr. Funyak, seconded by Mr. Workley, that this AHBR Application be approved as amended with fenestration on the west elevation as approved by staff. The motion carried by the following vote:

H. AHBR 21-310 38 Division Street (Historic District)

Addition (Breezeway & Kitchen)

Attachments: 38 Division Street AHBR Packet

Ms. Krickovich introduced the application by displaying the elevations and noting AHBR approved this application on June 9, 2021, with the following conditions: The siding be feathered in, a dormer be built on the garage, and the breezeway be inset. These items were not done.

Mr. Jeff Goodman, Ultimate Home Remodeling, noted he was instructed by staff to cut as little of the original house as possible resulting in the siding not being feathered in. Mr. Goodman also stated a six window door was approved but an eight panel full-light door was installed in the rear to allow more light, the dormer was not installed because doing so would create a roof leak potential, and the breezeway was inset as far as it would go based on the position of the garage.

The Board, applicant and staff discussed: The dormer while it was a condition will not be required by AHBR, that feathering in the siding was also a condition, however, the non-blended look is acceptable, the lack of the breezeway being inset is probably not required by the Architectural Design Standards and is complicated by the change of foundation material on the two sides of the door which existed prior to this work, that adding trim on both side of the breezeway door is a possible solution, and that the rear breezeway door would have been approved by the Board.

A motion was made by Mr. Workley, seconded by Mr. Funyak, that this AHBR Application be approved as amended with the inset area having consistent siding from top to bottom on each side of the door. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye: 7 - Mr. Caputo, Mr. Funyak, Ms. Kenney, Ms. Marzulla, Mr. Ray, Mr. Wetzel and Mr. Workley

I. AHBR 24-199 134 Chadbourne Drive

Addition (First Floor Garage & Second Floor)

Attachments: 134 Chadbourne Dr. AHBR Packet

Ms.Krickovich introduced the application by displaying the site plan and elevations and reviewing the staff comments.

Mr. Nate Bailey, Hara Architects, stated the siding will be removed and new siding reinstalled with shingles of a similar grade and style to match the existing. Regarding the shutters Mr. Bailey stated by not installing shutters he is able to have larger windows with more interior light.

The Board, applicant and staff discussed installing shutters and noted it would require large shutters to cover a window as shown.

A motion was made by Mr. Workley, seconded by Ms. Marzulla, that this AHBR Application be approved as submitted with siding to match the side of the garage door and asphalt shingles. The motion carried by the following vote:

J. AHBR 24-203 43 Church Street (Historic District)

Addition (Entertaining Space)

Attachments: 43 Church Street AHBR Packet

Ms. Krickovich introduced the application by displaying renderings of the proposed additions.

Mr. Nick Boka, and Mr. Brian Swartz, Anthony Slabaugh Remodeling, introduced the application by describing the front and rear main masses of the house, the work done in 2018 and 2019 on this property, the various iterations of the proposed addition, and the existing cedar shakes to be removed, repaired and reinstalled on the west side, if and whenever possible.

The Board, applicant and staff discussed: That the addition is staying within the site lines of the original house, that a site visit with the historic consultant would benefit the Board, that variances from BZBA are needed prior to AHBR approval, that approximately 1000 square feet in additions have or will take place, and that a wood door can be installed if AHBR makes that a condition.

Staff agreed to arrange a site visit.

A motion was made by Ms. Marzulla, seconded by Mr. Ray, to conduct a site visit with the historic consultant and continue this application following the BZBA meeting. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye: 7 - Mr. Caputo, Mr. Funyak, Ms. Kenney, Ms. Marzulla, Mr. Ray, Mr. Wetzel and Mr. Workley

K. AHBR 24-205 121 Elm Street (Historic District)

Addition (Kitchen and Primary Suite)

Attachments: 121 Elm St. AHBR Packet

Ms. Krickovich introduced the application by introducing the applicants.

Mr. Gordon Costlow, designer, and Mr. Joseph Morono, homeowner, described the 1889 home redesign to: Enlarge the kitchen, laundry room and add an addition for a first floor master suite. Mr. Costlow noted the addition is smaller and about the same height as the existing house, that the new rear porch has a hip roof which mimics the front roof, and that the right elevation has an existing gable which will be widened.

The Board, applicant and staff discussed: The elevations which were handed out to the Board at the meeting which showed: Alternative roof lines, the height of the addition in relation to the existing house, the possible reuse of the existing gables, that the original dormer should remain with shed roofs on the side which will help with the connection to the historic house, that the same dormer/roof style should be built on the addition, that the rear roof style should be rethought, and that the proposed addition is not subordinate to the main mass.

A motion was made by Ms. Kenney, seconded by Mr. Funyak, that the historic consultant and Board conduct a site visit and the application be continued. The motion carried by the following vote:

VII. Other Business

A. <u>AHBR 2-28-24 Minutes of Previous Architectural & Historic Board of Review Meeting:</u> February 28, 2024.

Attachments: Fel

February 28, 2024 AHBR Minutes - Draft

The February minutes were continued to the April meeting.

VIII. Staff Update

Ms. Krickovich noted that Mr. Funyak and Ms. Kenney's appointments to the Board will be completed this summer.

This matter was discussed

IX. Adjournment

A motion was made by Ms. Marzulla, seconded by Ms. Kenney, that the meeting be adjourned at 9:38 p.m. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye: 7 - Mr. Caputo, Mr. Funyak, Ms. Kenney, Ms. Marzulla, Mr. Ray, Mr. Wetzel and Mr. Workley

John Caputo, Chair	
John Workley, Secretary	
Joe Campbell, Executive Assistant	

Upon approval by the Architectural & Historic Board of Review, this official written summary of the meeting minutes shall become a permanent record, and the official minutes shall also consist of a permanent audio and video recording, excluding executive sessions, in accordance with Codified Ordinances, Section 252.04, Minutes of Architectural and Historic Board of Review, Board of Zoning and Building Appeals, and Planning Commission.

* * *