

DATE: July 8, 2022

PROJECT ADDRESS: 16 Baldwin Street

TO: Alicia Schrenk, Associate Planner, City of Hudson, 1140 Terex Road, Hudson, Ohio 44236

FROM: Wendy Naylor, Naylor Wellman, LLC, Preservation Consultant

---

## OVERVIEW

At the request of the City of Hudson, Naylor Wellman is providing this Design Review Advisory Report to assist the Architectural and Historic Board of Review (AHBR) in their review of the Owner Application requesting alterations to the locally designated historic property located at 16 Baldwin Street. The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Technical Preservation Services Briefs were reviewed as part of this report.

## QUALIFICATIONS

*Principals, Wendy Hoge Naylor and Diana Wellman, are registered Preservation Consultants qualified under the Federal Historic Preservation Professional requirements as described in the U.S. Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Archeology and Historic Preservation (48 FR 44716).*

## Sources

- ✓ *AHBR 6/22/22 Agenda Staff Comments – 16 Baldwin Street, OHI Form*
- ✓ *Proposed Rick Hawksley Architect Drawings including Window and Door Options*
- ✓ *AHBR & Naylor Wellman Site Visit, 7/5/2022*

---

## PROPOSED ALTERATIONS – 16 Baldwin Street

- *Owner stated at site visit that window replacements will be accomplished by repurposing existing ca. 2006 vinyl replacement windows with between the glass grilles installed in new locations*
- *New curved transom window at rear elevation*
- *Installation of double door replacing existing replacement single front door entry*
- *Installation of single door at east elevation*

**PROJECT BACKGROUND AND DESCRIPTION**

- The property is located on the south side of Baldwin Street, between the N. Main Street corridor and College Street with primary public site line views of the façade facing Baldwin Street.



- *The ca. 1923 Side Gable single dwelling is located in the local Hudson Historic District and subject to review using the Secretary of Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation, under Hudson Code section 111-1-2b (1) as greater than 50 years old.*
- **Relevant Historic Character Defining Features**  
A 1950 Historic Image shows a Bungalow house with character defining features including flared side gabled roof, exposed rafter tails and central chimney.



- *The owner stated at the site visit that in ca. 2006 a previous owner had “gutted the house to the studs.” The roof line has been altered with the addition of a large front gable dormer and removal of the central chimney. Rafter tails have been removed and the roof eaves finished with wide boards and modified corner returns. A broken pediment entry supported by square columns and new single-entry door with sidelights has been added.*



- *An east elevation covered gable roof porch with contemporary entry door and garden box window appear to have been added.*



- *Vinyl replacement windows with interior muntin bars (grilles) were installed throughout the house in ca. 2006 or more recently.*



- *The ca. 2006 rear addition*



▪ **Relevant Historic Character Defining Features impacted are:**

*Historic windows and doors have been previously removed and replaced, with no evidence of remaining historic window or door fabric.*

**DETERMINATION OF EFFECT:**

**ISSUE:** The AHRB is asking for a determination on whether the proposed alterations including window and door replacement impact the historic integrity of the house.

**RECOMMENDATION**

---

***Recommendation for approval of proposed plans due to previous alterations to the house and absence of relevant historic fabric with the following suggestions:***

***(a) Rear addition transom windows be replaced with a rectilinear shaped glass instead of curved glass consistent with the fenestration language.***

***(b) The existing front entry door opening is larger than a single door; a single door front entry with side-lites may be more compatible with the historic character of the house rather than the proposed double doors.***

**END of REPORT**

---

## APPENDIX

### DESIGN CRITERIA

#### CITY OF HUDSON CODIFIED ORDINANCE - DESIGN CONSIDERATIONS

*Relevant Sections highlighted in grey.*

Section III-2. - Alterations to existing properties - all types.

The character of Hudson is preserved by maintaining the integrity of buildings as they are altered.

a. *Alterations to non-historic buildings.* The following shall apply to all buildings which are not historic properties, as defined in Section III-2(b).

(1) In the case of an alteration to an existing property, an applicant must comply with the type design Standards in Part IV to the extent that they apply to the alteration itself.

(2) Applicants will be permitted to repair or replace existing non-conforming elements without bringing the element into conformance with the Standards, for example, shutters or windows may be replaced with essentially the same elements.

(3) If applicants propose to replace any element with another that is not the same (for example, aluminum windows for wood windows), the applicant will be required to conform fully with the Standards for those elements.

(4) Applicants may not be compelled to alter any part of the existing property which would otherwise not be affected by the proposed alteration.

(5) For existing buildings which do not conform to the type catalogue in Part IV, alterations will be allowed as long as they conform to the general principles enumerated in Section I-2, and they are compatible with the existing architectural style, materials, and massing of the building.

b. *Standards for historic properties, all districts.* Historic properties include those buildings which are contributing to historic districts and buildings which are designated as historic landmarks by the City Council. Other buildings which have historic or architectural significance may be also be reviewed as historic properties with the mutual agreement of the AHBR and the applicant.

(1) Historic landmarks or buildings within historic districts which are greater than fifty years old will not be reviewed according to the type Standards in Part IV. Such buildings will be reviewed according to the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Historic Rehabilitation (*see Appendix I) and National Park Service Preservation Briefs #14 and #16.*

(2) In altering historic properties, the applicant is advised to refer to historic surveys and style guides which have been prepared specifically for Hudson, including the **Uniform Architectural Criteria** by Chambers & Chambers, 1977; **Hudson: A Survey of History Buildings in an Ohio Town** by Lois Newkirk, 1989; and **Square Dealers**, by Eldredge and Graham.

(3) Hudson's Historic District and Historic Landmarks contain a wealth of properties with well preserved and maintained high quality historic building materials. The preservation of these materials is essential to the distinguishing character of individual properties and of the district. Deteriorated materials shall be repaired where feasible rather than replaced. In the event that replacement is appropriate, the new material should be compatible in composition, design, color, and texture.

(i). Use of Substitute materials for Historic Properties (as defined in Section III-2. b.).

- (a.) The AHBR shall review detailed documentation of the existing site conditions.
  - (b.) The AHBR shall request the patching and repair of existing materials.
  - (c.) If the repair or replacement of existing non-historic materials is requested, AHBR shall request removal of the non-historic material to expose the historic material so that it may be assessed.
  - (d.) If the AHBR concurs that the condition of the material requires replacement in some or all portions of the structure, like materials should be used. Substitute materials may be considered when the proposed materials do not alter the historic appearance of the structure, and the proposed materials are compatible in proportion, size, style, composition, design, color, and texture with the existing historic materials.
- (ii). Use of Substitute materials for proposed additions to existing historic properties.
    - (a.) The placement of the addition shall be reviewed to determine its visibility from the public realm.
    - (b.) Substitute materials are acceptable provided they are compatible in proportion, size, style, composition, design, color, and texture with the existing historic materials.
  - (iii). New freestanding structures and non-historic properties: The use of substitute materials is acceptable provided they are compatible in proportion, size, style, composition, design, color, and texture of historic materials.
  - (iv). All applications are subject to Section II-1(c).

## SECRETARY OF THE INTERIOR'S STANDARDS FOR REHABILITATION

---

*Relevant Sections highlighted in grey.*

The Standards (Department of Interior regulations, 36 CFR 67) pertain to historic buildings of all materials, construction types, sizes, and occupancy and encompass the exterior and the interior, related landscape features and the building's site and environment as well as attached, adjacent, or related new construction. The Standards are to be applied to specific rehabilitation projects in a reasonable manner, taking into consideration economic and technical feasibility.

1. A property shall be used for its historic purpose or be placed in a new use that requires minimal change to the defining characteristics of the building and its site and environment.
2. The historic character of a property shall be retained and preserved. The removal of historic materials or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a property shall be avoided.
3. Each property shall be recognized as a physical record of its time, place, and use. Changes that create a false sense of historical development, such as adding conjectural features or architectural elements from other buildings, shall not be undertaken.
4. Most properties change over time; those changes that have acquired historic significance in their own right shall be retained and preserved.
5. Distinctive features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a property shall be preserved.
6. Deteriorated historic features shall be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature shall match the old in design, color, texture, and other visual qualities and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features shall be substantiated by documentary, physical, or pictorial evidence.
7. Chemical or physical treatments, such as sandblasting, that cause damage to historic materials shall not be used. The surface cleaning of structures, if appropriate, shall be undertaken using the gentlest means possible.
8. Significant archeological resources affected by a project shall be protected and preserved. If such resources must be disturbed, mitigation measures shall be undertaken.
9. New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction shall not destroy historic materials that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and shall be compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features to protect the historic integrity of the property and its environment.
10. New additions and adjacent or related new construction shall be undertaken in such a manner that if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.