

City of Hudson, Ohio

Meeting Minutes - Final Architectural & Historic Board of Review

John Caputo, Chair Allyn Marzulla, Vice Chair John Workley, Secretary John Funyak Françoise Massardier-Kenney William Ray Karl Wetzel

Nicholas Sugar, City Planner Amanda Krickovich, Associate Planner

Wednesday, April 10, 2024

7:30 PM

Town Hall 27 East Main Street

I. Call To Order

Chair Caputo called to order the regularly scheduled meeting of the Architectural & Historic Board of Review of the City of Hudson at 7:30 p.m., in accordance with the Sunshine Laws of the State of Ohio, O.R.C. Section 121.22.

II. Roll Call

Present: 5 - Mr. Caputo, Ms. Kenney, Ms. Marzulla, Mr. Ray and Mr. Workley

Absent: 2 - Mr. Funyak and Mr. Wetzel

III. Public Comment

Chair Caputo opened the meeting to public comments for anyone wanting to address the Board. There were no comments.

IV. Consent Applications

A motion was made by Mr. Workley, seconded by Ms. Kenney, to approve the Consent Agenda. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye: 5 - Mr. Caputo, Ms. Kenney, Ms. Marzulla, Mr. Ray and Mr. Workley

A. AHBR 24-194 7030 Saint Ives Blvd

Accessory Structure (Shed)

Attachments: 7030 Saint Ives Ct. AHBR Packet

This AHBR application was approved on the Consent Agenda.

B. AHBR 24-212 1664 Haymarket Way

Accessory Structure (Pavilion)

<u>Attachments:</u> 1664 E. Haymarket Way AHBR Packet

This AHBR application was approved on the Consent Agenda.

V. Old Business

A. <u>AHBR 24-65</u> 136 Hudson Street (Historic District)

Addition (1,763sqft bedroom, laundry, family room & screen porch)

Attachments: 136 Hudson Street AHBR Packet 4.10.24 Meeting

Perspectus Report - 136 Hudson Street - 3.8.2024

136 Hudson St. AHBR Packet

136 Hudson Street Material Specifications

Ms. Krickovich introduced the application by: Noting the Board discussed this application at the February 28, 2023 meeting and the historic consultant submitted a report with suggestions. Ms. Krickovich also displayed the elevations and reviewed the staff comments and recommendations.

Mr. Fred Margulies, architect, explained the type of windows and their design, the siding which will be feathered in, the banding around the house, the use of the garage as living space, and the column effect on the screened porch.

The Board, applicant and staff discussed: How the garage will be used as living space, the board and batten doors, the type of windows to be added, the size and location of the new gable, the two new columns, the new door, the freeze board on the front porch, that a Greek Revival door was recommended by the historic consultant, that the foundation will match the brick of the house, the possibility of the new gable on the west side being sided or having windows above the freeze board, that the siding material will match the existing siding, and that the totality of the additions are larger than the historic portion of the house.

A motion was made by Mr. Workley, seconded by Mr. Ray, that this AHBR Application be approved as amended with the four panel front doors as originally submitted, the six windows separated, and the west elevation screen door pitch to be sided with a window as approved by staff. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye: 4 - Mr. Caputo, Ms. Kenney, Mr. Ray and Mr. Workley

Nay: 1 - Ms. Marzulla

B. <u>AHBR 24- 135</u> 1727 Mayflower Lane

Addition (Attached Garage)

Attachments: 1727 Mayflower Lane AHBR Packet 4.10.24 Meeting

1727 Mayflower Lane AHBR Packet 2.28.24 Meeting

Ms. Kirckovich introduced the application by noting it was reviewed by AHBR on February 28, 2024, describing the revisions and reviewing the staff comments and recommendations.

The Board spoke against the large garage door on the front of the house.

Mr. Timothy Raggets, applicant, noted the large garage door was to allow a recreational vehicle to be stored inside and asked if a door that mimics the siding might be permitted in the front of the house.

The Board, applicant and staff noted that a new door would be required to meet the current code, that fenestration would need to be added to two sides of the house, that a fourteen-foot door in the rear may be acceptable, that a six-inch height differential is planned in the roofs, and that the deck elevation is not on the plans.

Mr. Raggets requested the application be tabled.

This matter was continued.

VI. New Business

AHBR 24- 248 49 Village Way (Porta Rossa)

Signs (Wall & Projecting)

Attachments: 49 Village Way AHBR Packet

Ms. Krickovich introduced the application by describing the sign and reviewing the staff comments.

Mr. Mark Branovic, applicant, confirmed the sign will be at least seven-feet from the ground, and will have a matte finish.

The Board, staff, and the applicant discussed, the sign being centered between the brick band and the window above, and the colors on the sign.

A motion was made by Mr. Workley, seconded by Ms. Kenney, that this application be approved as amended with the sign being centered on the brick band, that the pendent sign be at least seven-feet above the ground and the lettering be matte finish. The motion carried by the following vote:

B. AHBR 24-292 6719 Stow Road

Fence (4ft glass material)

Attachments: 6719 Stow Rd. AHBR Packet

Ms. Krickovich introduced the application by describing the fence and materials, reviewing the design standards and staff comments.

Mr. Anthony Fratantonio, homeowner, was present for the meeting.

The Board, applicant and staff discussed the exceptional design of the submittal, that this type of design was not anticipated when the Design Standards were created, and the large lot.

A motion was made by Mr. Workley, seconded by Mr. Ray, that this AHBR Application be approved based on the exceptional design and large lot. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye: 5 - Mr. Caputo, Ms. Kenney, Ms. Marzulla, Mr. Ray and Mr. Workley

C. <u>AHBR 24-241</u> 120 Elm Street (Historic District)

Alteration (Window replacement)

Attachments: 120 Elm Street AHBR Packet

Ms. Krickovich introduced the application by displaying photos of the house, describing the project and materials and reviewing the staff comments.

Mr. Andrew Girskey, Renewal by Anderson, stated his company previously installed composite windows at this address.

The Board noted that sufficient evidence has not been provided to show the windows cannot be repaired, and that composite windows are not approved in the historic district.

Mr. Sugar noted Elm Street was placed in the Historic District approximately three years ago.

A motion was made by Ms. Marzulla, seconded by Mr. Workley, that this AHBR Application be denied based on Elm Street being placed in the Historic District causing the proposed windows not being appropriate. The Board determined a site visit is needed. The motion was approved by the following vote:

Aye: 5 - Mr. Caputo, Ms. Kenney, Ms. Marzulla, Mr. Ray and Mr. Workley

D. <u>AHBR 24-272</u> 82 Church Street (Historic District)

Alteration (Roof Replacement)

<u>Attachments:</u> 82 Church Street AHBR Packet

Ms. Krickovich introduced the application by displaying photos of the roof, and reviewing the staff comments.

Mr. Sam Chin representing the owners, described the various shingles on the house and stated shingles are being replaced like for like.

A motion was made by Ms. Kenney, seconded by Mr. Workley, that this AHBR Application be approved. The motion carried by the following vote:

E. AHBR 24-303 7793 Valley View Road

Alterations & Addition (Siding, Dormer, Windows, Porch & Pergola)

Attachments: 7793 Valley View AHBR Packet

Ms. Krickovich introduced the application by displaying the elevations, describing the project, and reviewing the staff comments.

Ms. Rebecca Pantuso, Pantuso Architects, described the stone veneer which will be used for weight considerations, the siding on the dormers, the arch topped windows, that the right and left dormers will be made to match, that the copula is being used to shield a massing issue, that windows will be added, and noting the windows to be replaced.

The Board, applicant and staff discussed: 1) The siding which will match. 2) That the dormers should match each other. 3) That all seven, or at least the four front dormers should match. 4) That the roof of the house should be balanced with matching dormers. 5) That the house if far off the road and not in view. 6) That siding might be acceptable on the side of the house.

A motion was made by Mr. Workley, seconded by Mr. Ray, that this AHBR Application be approved as amended with the front four dormers matching.. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye: 5 - Mr. Caputo, Ms. Kenney, Ms. Marzulla, Mr. Ray and Mr. Workley

F. AHBR 24-195 172 Aurora (Historic District)

Alteration, Addition & Accessory Structure (Siding, roof, windows, great room addition & detached garage and pool house)

Attachments: 172 Aurora Street AHBR Packet

Ms. Krickovich introduced the application by displaying photos, describing the site plan and project, and reviewing the staff comments.

Mr. Justin Kapela, J Kapela Design & Construction, and Mr. David Moorhead, homeowner, described the project which includes: 1) Aligning the windows. 2) The deterioration of the existing siding and cedar siding replacement material. 3) Renovations to a previous addition. 4) The trim details. 5) The addition of a garage and pool house and the associated materials. 6) The proposed replacement windows. 7) The 1930s clay-block garage to be removed. 8) The homeowner noted the house is in total disrepair and his desire to build a good house to last another hundred years.

The Board questioned if the header boards below the freeze can be used on the new garage.

The Board decided to conduct a site visit with the historic consultant.

A motion was made by Ms. Kenney, seconded by Mr. Ray, to conduct a site visit with the historic consultant. The motion carried by the following vote:

G. AHBR 24-226 2474 Cottager Drive

Addition (Bedroom)

Attachments: 2474 Cottager Dr. AHBR Packet

Ms. Krickovich introduced the application by displaying and describing the site plan and reviewing the staff comments.

Mr. Brian Gorog, homeowner, was present for the meeting.

A motion was made by Ms. Kenney, seconded by Mr. Ray, that this AHBR Application be approved. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye: 5 - Mr. Caputo, Ms. Kenney, Ms. Marzulla, Mr. Ray and Mr. Workley

H. AHBR 24-234 6095 Nicholson Drive

Addition (Porch)

<u>Attachments:</u> 6095 Nicholson Drive AHBR Packet

Ms. Krickovich introduced the application by displaying and describing the elevations and reviewing the staff comments.

Mr. Stephen Cochran, Cochran's Remodeling and Construction, was present for the meeting.

A motion was made by Mr. Workley, seconded by Mr. Ray, that this AHBR Application be approved as amended with a matching chimney. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye: 5 - Mr. Caputo, Ms. Kenney, Ms. Marzulla, Mr. Ray and Mr. Workley

I. AHBR 24-302 1505 Hines Hill Road

Addition (Garage & Living Space)

Attachments: 1505 Hines Hill Rd. AHBR Packet

Ms. Krickovich introduced the application by displaying and describing the large addition and reviewing the staff comments.

Mr. Joe Matava, Peninsula Architects, noted: Taking into account the chimney location and function - the proposed material change seems to be the best solution, that the shutters should match, and presented window and shutter alternatives for the board to consider.

The Board, applicant and staff discussed: The stone on the chimney which will be continued to an inside corner, and the use of smaller windows and shutters.

A motion was made by Mr. Ray, seconded by Ms. Marzulla, that this AHBR Application be approved as amended with the windows on the garage being separated with shutters. The motion carried by the following vote:

J. AHBR 24-304 2738 Ellsworth Hill Drive

Addition (Family Room)

Attachments: 2738 Ellsworth Hill Dr. AHBR Packet

Ms. Krickovich introduced the application by displaying and describing the project and reviewing the staff comments.

Ms. Bridget Tiption, applicant, was present for the meeting.

A motion was made by Ms. Kenney, seconded by Mr. Ray, that this AHBR Application be approved. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye: 5 - Mr. Caputo, Ms. Kenney, Ms. Marzulla, Mr. Ray and Mr. Workley

VII. Other Business

A. <u>AHBR 2-28-24</u> Minutes of Previous Architectural & Historic Board of Review Meeting: February 28, 2024.

Attachments: February 28, 2024 AHBR Minutes - Draft

A motion was made by Ms. Marzulla, seconded by Mr. Workley, that the February 28, 2024, Minutes be approved as amended. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye: 5 - Mr. Caputo, Ms. Kenney, Ms. Marzulla, Mr. Ray and Mr. Workley

B. <u>AHBR 3-13-24</u> Minutes of Previous Architectural & Historic Board of Review Meeting: March 13, 2024.

Attachments: March 13, 2024 AHBR Minutes - Draft

A motion was made by Ms. Marzulla, seconded by Mr. Ray, that the March 13, 2024, AHBR Application be approved as amended. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye: 5 - Mr. Caputo, Ms. Kenney, Ms. Marzulla, Mr. Ray and Mr. Workley

VIII. Staff Update

Mr. Sugar noted the Earth Day event will be held on the downtown green this year.

This matter was discussed

IX. Adjournment

A motion was made by Ms. Marzulla, seconded by Mr. Ray, that the meeting be adjourned at 9:35 p.m.. The motion carried by the following vote:

| John Caputo, Chair | |
|-----------------------------------|--|
| John Workley, Secretary | |
| Joe Campbell, Executive Assistant | |

Upon approval by the Architectural & Historic Board of Review, this official written summary of the meeting minutes shall become a permanent record, and the official minutes shall also consist of a permanent audio and video recording, excluding executive sessions, in accordance with Codified Ordinances, Section 252.04, Minutes of Architectural and Historic Board of Review, Board of Zoning and Building Appeals, and Planning Commission.

* * *