



Mr. Kevin Powell
Assistance Director of Public Works - Utilities
1769 Georgetown Road
Hudson, OH 44236

Eastside Substation Transformer Replacement Project Installation Bid Analysis and Recommendation

Dear Kevin,

We have completed our analysis of the bids received on May 16, 2023, for the Hudson Public Power Eastside Substation Transformer Replacement project installation. Three bids were received, and a bid tabulation spreadsheet was developed for bid comparison (see *Exhibit A*). The five bids were analyzed based on price, schedule, experience, qualifications, references, exceptions, substitutions, clarifications, and other pertinent factors.

The five bids ranged from \$241,873.31 (Thompson Electric) to \$356,441 (Westfield Electric) for bid items 100, 200, and 300. The alternate bid items, 400 and 500, exceeded the expected pricing for the project and will not be considered. The bids were ranked by the bid price, and we focused on the two lowest bidders, Thompson Electric and Sargent. The two lowest bidders took no exception to the desired project completion dates. All the remaining terms of the project, including bond, payment terms, warranties, and liquidated damages, were acceptable, with no exceptions taken. The subcontractors listed in their bid proposals were acceptable.

The total bid price for Thompson Electric was approximately <1% above the engineer's estimated construction cost of \$240,000; all other bids were above the estimated construction cost. The next lowest bidder, Sargent, was approximately 13% above the engineer's estimate. Therefore, we recommend the City award the installation contract to Thompson Electric for the total bid price of \$241,873.31 based on the following criteria:

1. Thompson Electric was the low bidder.
2. Thompson Electric is a well-qualified contractor with extensive experience in municipal substation work, including prior construction work for the City of Hudson Electric Department (Hudson Public Power), the City of Cuyahoga Falls, and other Ohio Municipalities.
3. Thompson Electric is a local company headquartered in Munroe Falls, Ohio.
4. Thompson Electric was present at the Prebid meeting.
5. The subcontractors listed in Thompson Electric's bid proposal are acceptable.
6. GPD has worked with Thompson Electric on numerous substation projects with good experience and results.
7. We confirmed the following with Thompson Electric on 5/22/23:
 - a. Thompson intends to meet all requirements outlined in the project specifications at the prices quoted with no work scope exceptions or omissions.
 - b. Thompson Electric takes no exceptions to the terms listed in the bid documents.
 - c. Thompson Electric agrees to the dates specified in the bid documents for Substantial Completion by December 31, 2023, and Total Project Completion by March 31, 2024.



This award recommendation represents the selection of the lowest and best bid considering all pertinent factors identified above and will best serve the interest of the City of Hudson and its electric customers.

If you have any questions, please do not hesitate to call me at 330-572-2277.

Respectfully submitted,

GPD GROUP

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read "SSchaub", is written over a light gray grid background.

Steve Schaub, P.E.

Attachments

cc: Dave Griffith - HPP
Jim O'Connor - GPD
Daulton Baksa - GPD

O:\2022\2022041 HPP\01 - Eastside TR Replacement\400_Construction Engineering\02_Construction Coordination\Bidding\02 - Bid Tabulation\Hudson Eastside Sub Installation Bid Recommendation (FINAL).docx

EXHIBIT A
CITY OF HUDSON EASTSIDE SUBSTATION TR REPLACEMENT PROJECT
INSTALLATION BID SUMMARY FOR MAY 16, 2023 BID OPENING

GPD P/N 2017041.04	INSTALLATION CONTRACTOR		
DESCRIPTION	Sargent	Thompson	Westfield
BID ITEM 100: DEMOLITION			
Bid Price - Materials & Labor	\$34,689.59	\$9,188.25	\$15,690.00
BID ITEM 200: SUBSTATION INSTALLATION			
Bid Price - Materials & Labor	\$187,508.85	\$203,252.81	\$323,851.00
BID ITEM 300: ACCEPTANCE TESTING			
Bid Price - Materials & Labor	\$50,065.70	\$29,432.25	\$16,900.00
ALT BID ITEM 400: OIL CONTAINMENT			
Bid Price - Materials & Labor	\$78,612.67	\$72,934.25	\$36,943.00
ALT BID ITEM 500: TRANSFORMER REMOVAL			
Bid Price - Materials & Labor	\$15,309.63	\$53,940.13	\$32,000.00
TOTAL ALL BID ITEMS			
Bid Price - Materials & Labor	\$366,186.44	\$314,807.56	\$393,384.00
Bid Price - Bid Items 100-300	\$272,264.14	\$241,873.31	\$356,441.00
BID RANKING	2	1	3
ANTICIPATED PO AWARD DATE (ON OR BEFORE)		Friday, August 4, 2023	
SUBSTANTIAL COMPLETION DUE DATE: 12/31/23		No Exception Taken	No Exception Taken
TOTAL COMPLETION DUE DATE: 3/31/24		No Exception Taken	No Exception Taken
SIGNED PROPOSAL	Yes	Yes	Yes
BID GUARANTY BOND OR 10% CHECK	Yes	Yes	Yes
AFFIDAVIT OF NON-COLLUSION	Yes	Yes	Yes
EXPERIENCE STATEMENT	Yes	Yes	Yes
SUBCONTRACTOR LIST (SEE BELOW)	Yes	Yes	No
ACKNOWLEDGEMENT OF ADDENDA	N/A	N/A	N/A
ATTENDED PRE-BID MEETING	Yes	Yes	Yes
SUBSTATION EXPERIENCE REFERENCES CITED	Yes	Yes	Yes
SUBCONTRACTORS			
Survey		Bair, Goodie, and Assoc.	
Foundations	Great Lakes Const.		
Transformer/Switchgear Demo & Removal	G&L Corporation	EnviroPro	
Electrical Acceptance Testing	RMS Energy	RMS Energy	
Oil Containment	CI Agent	CI Agent	
EXCEPTIONS	None	None	None
SUBSTITUTIONS	None	None	None

© 2022/2023/2024 HPP/F1 - Eastside TR Replacement#A00_Construction Engineering#02_Construction Coordinator/Bidding#02 - Bid Tabulation/Hudson Prospect Substation Insulation Bid Tabulation - Final.xls#SUMMARY