

Amanda Krickovich

From: Preview View <jdfield23@aol.com>
Sent: Wednesday, January 31, 2024 11:09 AM
To: Amanda Krickovich
Cc: Eric Chupack; Laurie Frankino; Wendy Hess; Mark Schildhouse; Jean Rhodes; Amy McCormick; Michael Ross
Subject: Temple Beth Shalom Security Door Application Follow-up
Attachments: Metal Door Photo.jpg; Temple Beth Shalom, Hudson Security Assessment 2023 - FINAL 3.30.2023.docx

Follow Up Flag: Follow up
Flag Status: Flagged

CAUTION: This email originated from outside the organization. Do not click links or open attachments unless you recognize the sender and know the content is safe.

Amanda

I have information regarding the follow-ups from our last presentation.

- **Determine if we can get an estimate of a wood-clad metal core security door within our financial capabilities.**
 - We followed up with the company that gave us the original estimate. They are a large national company, but do not provide these types of doors because there is not a production wood-clad security door available, unlike the metal "Victorian style" security door with panels that is proposed. We have found that the wood-clad metal security doors are custom-made and only available through specialty vendors.
 - I contacted two vendors, Fortified Estate, which had been suggested, and Fortified and Ballistic Security (FBS). Both companies emphasized that the key is security (forced entry resistance) vs ballistics (ammunition resistance). Resistance is defined as the length of time to breach the door. They both said that an all-wood door would not have the entry or ballistic resistance of a metal door with a metal frame. Both offer security rated steel doors with high quality wood coverings that can be compatible with the look of the Historic District. They would manufacture the door to our specifications, and ship for us to install. Both companies have specifically supplied Jewish Synagogues as well as government and business buildings. Fortified Estate quoted a cost of \$11,000 to \$16,000 while FBS quoted \$10,000 to \$14,000, with the price dependent on the exact details of the final door (windows, locking mechanism, frame requirements, etc.)
 - Temple Beth Shalom would certainly want to go with this solution. However, at a cost of at least \$10,000 we do not have the means to fund this purchase. I contacted FEMA, and they would not be able to increase the grant of \$2269. As a small congregation of about 80-100 families, we do not have the capacity to fund the incremental cost. Our hope is that the appearance of the Victorian Style metal security door will be compatible with the Historic District, particularly when painted as the current door is painted.
- **Determine that it would be feasible to retain the top 2 panels and have the security glass Lites only replace the middle 2 panels.**
 - The proposal has been reworked to retain the top 2 panels and have the security glass Lites only replace the middle 2 panels.

- **Send photos (vs renderings) of the metal 6 panel door before modification for Lites.**
 - The photo of the door is attached. My own perspective is that it has a very similar appearance to our current door.
- **Send a copy of the Temple Beth Shalom Security Assessment**
 - Attached

I understand that one of the concerns of the Hudson Architectural and Historic Board of Review is whether making an exception might set a precedent for the Historical District. I also know that the AHBR appreciates the security concerns of the Temple. I have pasted below the most recent warning we have received from the Jewish Federation of Cleveland JFC Security LLC. I am not sure if other institutions in the Historic District face the ongoing level of threats that we unfortunately are facing, or even have the need to belong to a security organization such as JFC Security LLC dedicated to their religious or other association. While we wish we did not have the need to enhance our security with items such as a security door, we are fortunate to have access to the FEMA and State of Ohio grants specifically designated for security from terrorist threats.

Again, thank you for your assistance and recommendations.

Regards

James Field, Co-President Hudson Temple Beth Shalom

Cell 330.962.7462

JFC Security was alerted today, Thursday, January 18, 2024, by an area law enforcement agency, that an individual named Michael Lamarca, (white male, 30 yrs. old, thin build), driving a 2010 White Ford Expedition with Ohio license plate # JDN- 5116, is being sought by the police for questioning. Be on the lookout for the Ford Expedition associated with Lamarca. JFC security officers have been advised.

Below is a recent photo of Lamarca, and vehicle associated with him.



ALLEGION

STEELCRAFT

919422
001

919422 001
919422 001



SECURITY ASSESSMENT FOR TEMPLE BETH SHALOM

On March 7, 2023, a security assessment was conducted by writer at Temple Beth Shalom at 50 Division Street, Hudson, OH, 44236.

By writer: Al Buckley, Security Guard for the JFC Security, LLC. and former Special Agent, Cleveland Division, FBI. 25701 Science Park Drive, Beachwood, OH, 44122. Contact: 216-593-2929. Present during the assessment was Temple Beth Shalom Co-President JAMES FIELD (330-962-7462)

A visual and physical inspection of the facility, the surrounding grounds and the overall infrastructure was conducted in order to identify key vulnerabilities.

The following is a list of key observations made during the course of this assessment. The options for consideration listed within the report are not intended to serve as a detailed vulnerability assessment but may be useful as one of many factors to be considered in implementing additional security and resiliency measures at the Temple Beth Shalom.

Some of the incidents that took place in Ohio, near this SYNAGOGUE included the following:

June 25, 2020, SAFE Cincinnati, Jewish Federation of Cincinnati reported that the PATRIOT FRONT (Neo-Nazi, Neo Fascist and American Nationalist group) had conducted a wide spread promotional campaign throughout various locations in the country.. One of the locations was listed as downtown Hudson, Ohio. Images of these postings were posted via Twitter. The Hudson Police Department reviewed the postings/photos and found several in the downtown section of Hudson, Ohio. They were removed. Downtown Hudson is two blocks from Hudson Temple Beth Shalom.

January 23, 2022, the home residence of OHIO STATE REPRESENTATIVE CASEY WEINSTEIN (one of two Jewish Members of the Ohio House) was targeted by members of the Liberty Valley Church. Members of this Church protested in front of his home residence (Hudson, Ohio). Protestors stated they were there "to make Casey Weinstein be better." CASEY WEINSTEIN is a member of the Temple Beth Shalom (Hudson).

January/February 2023 – On-line white supremacist groups announce February 25, 2023, as the "National Day of Hate" encouraging mass antisemitic activity throughout the area causing fear and anxiety throughout the Greater Cleveland Jewish Community.

October 15, 2022 – Oxford – Three individuals attack and destroy Jewish Student Center religious structure on the eve of Jewish holiday.

September 20, 2022 – Beachwood - Two spray painted swastikas are placed in front of a Jewish family's home on the eve of the Jewish holiday.

August 5, 2022 – Cleveland- A Jewish business owner has "Kill all the Jews" spray painted on the side of his building located at 2630 Payne Avenue, Cleveland, OH.

August 2, 2022 – Cleveland Heights - Hebrew Academy of Cleveland Oakwood school has its property defaced and spray painted with graffiti including "Jews!"

July 30, 2022 – Beachwood - The Maltz Museum of Jewish Heritage receives a call from an unknown individual asking, "can I come to the museum to see Nazi exhibits?"

July 14, 2022 – Akron- A local synagogue receives a voice mail message in which the caller states "All Jews must die!"

May 25, 2022 - An athlete from Lake Catholic High School was accused of wearing a swastika on his leg during a playoff game against Orange High School whose roster included several Jewish student athletes.

April 1, 2022 – Columbus – A private security guard working for a Jewish school is arrested and charged with making terroristic threats after posting on social media his desire to shoot students and parents at the school.

February 20, 2022 – Beachwood- Mandel Jewish Community Center and Maltz Museum of Jewish Heritage request police protection due to a posted social media threat from an individual who has made multiple threats in the past to area Jewish institutions, has a history of psychiatric evaluations and is known to possess firearms.

November 15, 2021 – Youngstown – Jewish Community Center received an online threat; "I will be at your JCC today and tomorrow planting bombs and then will shoot all you Jewish parasites!"

October 5, 2021 – a 13-year-old Jewish student from University Heights, OH while walking home from school has a beer bottle thrown at her head and is subjected to anti-Semitic slurs from a passing motorist.

September 17, 2021- Cleveland Heights – an individual enters Unger's Kosher Market on the eve of the sabbath and starts harassing Jewish customers shopping at the store. Upon being asked to leave he goes outside to the parking lot and removes an axe from his vehicle. He then threatens a young Jewish boy and the store manager with the axe.

August 21, 2021 – a white supremacist group targets the Maltz Museum of Jewish History in Beachwood, OH with signs that say, "Stop White Replacement."

June 11, 2021 – Group of six Jewish teens walking home from religious instruction at their Rabbi's home in Beachwood, OH are shot with paintballs in face and neck by a passing motorist.

June 12, 2021 – Beachwood- The president of the school board received a vulgar, antisemitic telephone message stating that "Jews should be killed, and that Hitler should have finished the job."

May 12, 2021 – University Heights – A young 13-year-old Jewish girl getting off a school bus was screamed at by a woman driving by in a dark SUV who yelled "fucking Jew" and threw a glass bottle at her head.

March 3, 2021- Beachwood, OH Jewish school board president has a voice mail message left on his phone in which the caller makes anti-Semitic comments and threatens to shoot him in the head

February 18, 2021 – Cleveland - During a remote class at a public school, a student changed their Zoom name to "burn all the Jews."

SUMMARY OF VULNERABILITIES:

This 2023 risk and vulnerability report and site visits, noted the following primary vulnerabilities and concerns:

Summary of Recommendations:

1. Perimeter

a. Main Entrance/Side Entrance

i. Observation:

The main entrance and side entrance are susceptible to a vehicle attack and needs subtle force protection enhancement. There were NO bollards located near the main entrance or anywhere surrounding the facility which allows easy access through the main door as well as the side door entrance. The lack of bollard(s) at the front entrance and side entrance area could allow a vehicle to gain speed in a frontal attack. The building is located adjacent to a residential road which has only posted parking restrictions. Temple Beth Shalom is in close proximity to the Hudson Green, an expansive grassy area in the center of Hudson that is open to the public and holds several annual functions which attract a large number of people (both City residents and outsiders). Temple Beth Shalom is located in close proximity to city-controlled property (sidewalks) and is located in a historical district which may require additional permits to construct any type of a barrier system. Their property line is very limited and would require a great deal of planning to ensure both the function and aesthetic quality of the bollard(s).

ii. Options for Consideration:

Replacement of the front entrance door and side door is recommended and should include a changeable lock code system and should include a window. Create standoff from potential vehicle attacks by placing aesthetic concrete bollards/planters or landscape boulders/shrubbery at the front drive entrance as well as around the perimeter and side entrance of the facility. This will prevent potential assailants from driving/attacking with a vehicle at the main entrance door.

b. Parking

i. Observation:

Only on-street parking is provided as the Temple does not have a designated parking lot. The area has no exterior cameras except for a Ring camera situated at the main entrance door as well as the side entrance door. The property line is very close to Hudson City property (roadway/tree lawn) and installing a fence is not a feasible option. The front of the building is easily recognized as a Jewish facility due to its architecture as well as the signage above the front door.

ii. Options for Consideration:

Address numbers should be more visible to responding emergency personnel. It is recommended that they implement a system to further identify employee vehicles. An option would include distributing employee/member parking tags (numbered) which would hang from the rearview mirror. Suspicious vehicles could be easily identified by the lack of the tag. In the event of an emergency it would be beneficial to assist in confirming occupants of the building. The number on the tag should define the individual's position within the Temple and a database should be created. Teachers should be issued a tag with a specified series of numbers and administration would also be issued a tag with a specific number. Members who have routine access to the Temple should also be issued a tag.

2. Interior

a. Windows/doors

i. Observation:

The windows and doors are very old and could be easily forced open/broken into. They do not have bullet proof windows or protective safety film on their exterior/interior windows. All windows should be replaced. They do not have an alerting system or audible door alarms if the doors are not properly secured or propped open. In an emergency, there are two defined areas to exit - the main door to the rear of the worship area or the side door to the east of the worship area.

ii. Options for Consideration:

It is recommended that the windows be replaced with a more secure option. In particular the windows adjacent to the side entrance need to be replaced with a system that allows easy visibility to vet individuals prior to being allowed into the building. A plan should be implemented to allow occupants of the facility to retreat to specifically designed "safe room" in the event of an intrusion/attack. These rooms should be equipped with additional panic buttons, pepper spray containers and a turn-key lock (specifically marked) indicating both the lock position as well as the unlock position. A system to enhance interior door security should be implemented. The "Bearcade" Lockdown Response System should be considered to enhance security in the event of an active shooter situation. First aid bags should also be readily available in these room. All exterior windows should be "numbered" which would assist First Responders in quickly locating the exact room/area/classroom needing assistance. The "number should be visible from both the interior and exterior of the window.

Install blast/intrusion mitigation safety film throughout the office areas and remaining windows. When utilizing blast mitigation or security window film, anchoring the windows into the frames will deter intrusion via window breaking and help prevent excessive debris in the event of a blast on all remaining windows/doors.

Install an alarm that would activate a warning/alert if a door is propped open over a certain amount of time. Place numbered decals on the outside of ALL doors that lead into the facility (both interior and exterior). In the event of an emergency members can easily access this information and relay location in the building.

b. Alarm

i. Observation:

The Temple does not have an alarm system. There is one (1) panic alarm in the building. There are no audible door alarms to alert if propped open or not shut properly. Contact with the area police department is only by landline or cell phone.

ii. Options for Consideration:

All exits should have an alarm to prevent doors from being propped open and unattended. Install an alarm system with monitoring capabilities as well as a direct method of communication to the area police department in the event of an emergency. Additionally, install a series of panic alarms in the office assigned to the Rabbi, in classrooms, in the sanctuary and at both the rear entrance as well as the main entrance. Ensure that all the buildings panic alarms when activated trigger a text/email notification to police, staff and congregants to alert them to the threat in the building.

c. Classroom Security/Building

i. Observation: Classroom Locks.

Currently there are no locks on the classroom doors. Staff should have the ability to immediately lock most of the doors from the inside in the event of an emergency. Most of the interior doors do not lock.

ii. Options for Consideration:

Install thumb turn locksets on all doors which will allow staff to lock classroom doors from inside the room without requiring a key.

d. Visitor Screening

i. Observation:

They do not have any type of access control system. The building currently is accessed by a punch locking system (series of numbered button). The current code used has not been changed for a very long time and over the years has been used by many people. The Temple is often available to outside organizations for meetings, etc.

ii. Options for Consideration:

All exterior doors should be equipped with access control units in order to properly vet all persons entering into the school. Only authorized persons issued a security card or fob should be admitted through these doors. All visitors to the building who are not regular patrons (Parents/Guardians, etc.) or unknown to staff should be screened through an electronic visitor management system which requires them to present the front desk staff member with a state-issued identification allowing instant identity verification and tracking of where visitors are allowed access within the building. It is suggested that the Raptor system which is currently utilized by the Jewish Federation would be an option to not only sign in visitors, etc., but could keep track of individuals who should not enter the facility. The option of using an electronic system would be beneficial for any custody dispute issues or restraining orders. This information could be uploaded into the system.

e. Video Monitoring and Cameras

i. Observation: No CCTV equipment in place.

There is currently no CCTV System in place that provides 360-degree exterior coverage of the building. They should consider installing a system that can be networked with the local Dispatch Center. The Jewish Federation of Cleveland and JFC Security LLC have a working relationship with the Dispatch Center. JFC Security LLC will have personnel assigned into the Dispatch Center to monitor and provide response to incidents observed or realized through the use of analytics built into all community cameras including those proposed for Temple Beth Shalom. Hudson Temple has expressed an interest in developing and submitting an Emergency Response Operational Plan to include plans for fire incidents, bomb threats, intruder reaction, chemical spill, tornado response and other incidents. A floor/building plan will be submitted to JFC Security as well as to the local Police Department. CPR and AID training is encouraged and will be scheduled.

ii. **Options for Consideration:**

Install a security camera system with IP color/day night lenses with auto focus/panoramic cameras. Ensure that the system installed comes with motion sensors to alert personnel to any movement in identified vulnerable areas, thus enabling prioritization of camera monitoring. Utilize operating software and the necessary hardware to allow all exterior cameras to be relayed via network to authorized users and first responders. Cameras should have “edge” analytic capabilities allowing for the activation of “trip lines” and immediate notification to staff within the synagogue, law enforcement and other first responders. Full exterior coverage should provide views of all entrances/exits, both pedestrian and vehicular, exterior windows and parking areas. Interior cameras should cover all hallways, cross halls, lobbies, and stairwells.

f. **Paging/Emergency Notification System**

i. **Observation:**

There currently exists no paging system either inside or outside of the Temple. Emergency notifications cannot be broadcast inside of the Temple or anywhere on the exterior areas of the building including the playground, parking lot and all walkways leading to entrances and exits from the building. There is no mass notification system that allows partner institutions and first responders to notify staff and students of a danger that might affect them.

ii. **Options for Consideration:**

Installation of a new IP based paging system with new IP speakers. Exterior speakers should be installed to ensure emergency notifications to all areas of the exterior of the facility could be heard. An alerting system should be installed that allows notifications from other institutions within the Community, Law Enforcement agencies and other first responders the ability to send emergency notifications directly to the school. System should be integrated with fire alarms, weather alerts and the school’s duress system to automate messaging on what to do, where to go and the “all clear” message.

Conclusion

The recommendations made in this report are predicated upon target hardening and improving Temple Beth Shalom’s outer perimeter security, promoting security integration with staff/local emergency responders and enhancing the existing inner security as part of a comprehensive plan to improve their overall safety.

With the submission of this report, JFC Security LLC has completed a security assessment for Temple Beth Shalom, establishing a baseline of options for consideration to increase security measures.

###



Figure 1 google earth view



Figure 2 google earth view



Figure 3 interior front door entrance



Figure 4 exterior view



Figure 5 exterior entrance on College Street - side door



Figure 6 entrance to worship area

Figure 7 kitchen area



Figure 8 panic alarm



Figure 9 - possible SAFE ROOM - Boiler room